

Science, Service, Stewardship



Results of Northeast Workshop on Defining Social and Economic Performance Measures for Catch Share Programs

Andrew Kitts, Patricia Pinto da Silva, and
Patricia Clay

Social Sciences Branch, Northeast Fisheries
Science Center

NOAA
FISHERIES
SERVICE

NOAA



Workshop Purpose, Approach, and Goals

Purpose: Bring together social scientists to help the SSB define socio-cultural and economic performance measures of catch share programs in the Northeast United States

Approach: Presented draft SSB performance measure plan, heard presentations by guest speakers on related performance measure work, and obtained feedback through working groups

Goals:

- Agree on a set of core performance measures and associated indicators
- Identify critical routine data collection needs
- Contribute to the development of a research agenda



Workshop Participants

Richard Pollnac	Chris Anderson	Susan Abbott-Jamieson	Barb Rountree
Seth Macinko	Mark Fina	Trish Clay	Scott Steinback
Shirley Fiske	Hiro Uchida	Eric Thunberg	Lisa Colburn
Madeleine Hall-Arber	Juan Agar	John Walden	Julie Olson
Rob Snyder	Robert Pomeroy	Min-Yang Lee	Chhandita Das
Mike Orbach	Dan Georgianna	Chad Demarest	Patricia Pinto da Silva
Dan Holland	Joe Terry	Ayeisha Brinson	Drew Kitts



Sources of Guidance/Information

- National standards
- Reauthorized MSA
- NOAA LAPP guidance document
- FMP goals and objectives
- Academic literature
- Grey literature (newspapers, ENGO reports, etc..., unpublished reports)



Emerging Themes/Draft Performance Measures

- 1. Financial viability**
- 2. Management costs and complexity**
- 3. Distributional outcomes**
- 4. Well-being**
- 5. Governance**
- 6. Stewardship**



SSB's Questions/Hypotheses

The following were the basis for SSB's draft performance measures and indicators and served as a guide for discussion at the workshop.....



Management Cost/Complexity

- Are regulations becoming more accessible or less so?
- How much time does it take for participants to understand the rules and regulations that govern their activities?
- What are the additional costs (or savings) to government associated with implementing catch share programs?
- What are the costs/savings for permit holders?



Financial Viability

- Do crew members fare better or worse under catch share systems?
- What happens to household earnings?
- Are vessel profits changing?
- Have ex-vessel prices changed?
- How well are dealers doing?
- What is the value of the quota?
- Are quota markets functioning properly?



Distributional Outcomes

- Has access to quota changed?
- Has there been concentration of quota ownership?
- How have employment opportunities changed?
- Are certain groups/types of people excluded?
Certain communities or geographic regions?
- How has the household adapted?



Well Being

- Are fishermen/crew/processing employees more or less satisfied with their jobs?
- Has fishing become safer?
- Has community well-being changed?
- Has fishing infrastructure changed?
- Are catch share programs changing the way fishermen relate to each other?



Stewardship

- Has the incentive to race for fish changed?
- Have catch share allocations improved participants' sense of stewardship?
- Have they changed the relationship between resource users and the resource?
- Are discard rates increasing? decreasing?



Governance

- Is participation in decision making/management changed?
- Has management become more relevant? Adaptive?
- Are fishermen able to stay within the limits of the catch share program?
- Is the process seen as more or less legitimate?



Summary of discussion and recommendations from working groups.....



Management Cost/Complexity

- Regulatory complexity
 - Important because it affects level and cost of compliance and can be a barrier to entry
 - Could measure perception of complexity (survey)
 - Could develop measures around regulatory actions
- Management cost
 - Participation costs to public/industry
 - Cost to government
 - Industry cost to join/maintain catch share program



Financial Viability

- Profit
- Productivity
- Crew wages
- Vulnerability (in terms of variability)
- Organizational structure
- Social capital



Distributional Outcomes

- Direct uses (more detail)
 - Input side (less detail)
 - Output side (less detail)
 - Spatial/temporal distribution
 - Important to track those who leave
- Indicators:
 - Employment
 - Crew
 - Market power/concentration
 - Membership structure
 - Subsidies



Well Being

- Conflict
- Port infrastructure
- Social networks
- Crime
- Poverty
- Unemployment
- Social service
- Health
- Education
- Job satisfaction
- Safety



Stewardship

- Compliance
- Attitudes/ethics
- Technological adaptation
- Going beyond what is required?
- Conservation versus stewardship



Governance

- Process legitimacy
- Transparency
- Opportunities for crew and new entrants
- Control/autonomy
- Compliance
- Fishermen's role in science
- Conflict
- NGO influence



Current Data Sources

- Federal Fishing Permit Application Data
- Federal Seafood Dealer Data
- Federal Fishing Vessel Logbook Data
- Federal Observer Data
- Fixed Cost Survey
- Days at Sea Leasing Data
- County Business Patterns Data (Census)
- Non-Employer Statistics (Census)
- Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (BLS)
- US Coast Guard Fishing Vessel Accident Incident Report



Next Steps for SSB

- Continue to **develop** economic and socio-cultural performance measures, indicators and key research questions with stakeholder input
- **Identify** data gaps and need for new data streams/research. (What are we currently collecting? What's missing?)
- **Prepare** for the possibility of increased funding (What expertise do we have? What's missing? What will we need to contract out?)
- **Provide** information, assessments, publications that improve our understanding of the human dimensions of catch share programs.
- **Develop** and increase the capacity of the SSB in terms of tracking fishery performance